## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF MISSISSIPPI WESTERN DIVISION

CORR WIRELESS
COMMUNICATIONS, L.L.C.
CELLULAR SOUTH, INC., and
CELLULAR SOUTH LICENSES, LLC

**PLAINTIFFS** 

vs.

CIVIL ACTION NO. 3:12-cv-036-SA-SAA

AT&T, INC., AT&T MOBILITY LLC, MOTOROLA SOLUTIONS, INC., MOTOROLA MOBILITY, INC., QUALCOMM INCORPORATED, and JOHN DOES 1-10

**DEFENDANTS** 

## MOTOROLA'S RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO AMEND COMPLAINT

Defendants Motorola Solutions, Inc. and Motorola Mobility LLC (f/k/a Motorola Mobility, Inc.) (collectively, "Motorola") submit this Response in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Amend Complaint [Doc. No. 105], and request that the Motion be denied in its entirety. As explained in Motorola's Memorandum Brief in Support of Motorola's Response in Opposition, denial of Plaintiffs' Motion is warranted because further amendment of the complaint would be futile.

This Response in Opposition is based on the accompanying Memorandum Brief, the supporting Declaration of Chahira Solh ("Solh Declaration"), Defendant AT&T Mobility LLC's Response in Opposition and the Memorandum of Law submitted in support thereof, Defendant Qualcomm Incorporated's Response in Opposition and the Memorandum of Law submitted in support thereof, and all other documents submitted in support thereof, as incorporated by reference hereby; the pleadings, records, and papers already on file in this action and those filed herein, and such other matters and oral argument as may be presented at any hearing on Plaintiffs' Motion.

Motorola hereby requests that the Court take judicial notice of the documents described below and attached to the Solh Declaration, which is Exhibit 1 to this Rebuttal. Motorola makes this request pursuant to Rule 201. The document must be one "not subject to reasonable dispute" in that it is generally known or capable of determination by resort to an unimpeachable source. Fed. R. Evid. 201(b). Rule 201(d) provides that the court "shall take judicial notice if requested by a party," as long as the court is "supplied with the necessary information" to show that the matter is subject to judicial notice. Rule 201(f) provides that judicial notice may be taken at any stage of the proceedings.<sup>1</sup>

- 1. **Exhibit A:** 3GPP Working Procedures, Article 10.
- 2. **Exhibit B:** 3rd Generation Partnership Project; Technical Specification Group Radio Access Network; User Equipment (UE) radio transmission and reception (FDD) (Release 7).

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Motorola requests that the Court deny Plaintiffs' Motion and enter a judgment dismissing Plaintiffs' Complaint with prejudice.

Dated: October 18, 2012 Respectfully submitted,

s/ Jim M. Greenlee

Jim M. Greenlee, MSB # 5001 James D. "J.D." Johnson, MSB # 102242 HOLCOMB, DUNBAR, WATTS, BEST, MASTERS & GOLMON 400 South Lamar Blvd., Suite A P.O. Box 707 Oxford, Mississippi 38655

Telephone: (662) 234-8775 Facsimile: (662) 238-7552 jgreenlee@holcombdunbar.com jdjohnson@holcombdunbar.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The subject documents are authenticated by the Solh Declaration, attached hereto as Exhibit 1.

John S. Gibson (admitted *pro hac vice*) Chahira Solh (admitted *pro hac vice*) CROWELL & MORING LLP 3 Park Plaza, 20th Floor Irvine, California 92614-8505 Telephone: (949) 263 8400 Facsimile: (949) 263 8414

jgibson@crowell.com csolh@crowell.com

Jason C. Murray (admitted *pro hac vice*) CROWELL & MORING LLP 515 South Flower Street, 40th Floor Los Angeles, California 90071 Telephone: (213) 622-4750 Facsimile: (213) 622-2690 jmurray@crowell.com

COUNSEL FOR DEFENDANTS
MOTOROLA MOBILITY LLC (f/k/a Motorola
Mobility, Inc.) AND MOTOROLA
SOLUTIONS, INC.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, JIM M. GREENLEE, of the firm of HOLCOMB, DUNBAR, WATTS, BEST, MASTERS & GOLMON, do hereby certify, that on **October 18, 2012**, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF system, which sent notification of such filing to the following:

Alan Walter Perry FORMAN, PERRY, WATKINS, KRUTZ & TARDY, PLLC P.O. Box 22608

Jackson, MS 39225-2608 Email: aperry@fpwk.com

Brian Craig Kimball
BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER &
HEWES
P. O. Drawer 119

Jackson, MS 39205-0119 Email: bkimball@brunini.com

Charles Louis McBride, Jr.
BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER &
HEWES
P. O. Drawer 119
Jackson, MS 39205-0119
Email: cmcbride@brunini.com

Daniel J. Mulholland FORMAN, PERRY, WATKINS, KRUTZ & TARDY, PLLC P.O. Box 22608 Jackson, MS 39225-2608

Email: mulhollanddj@fpwk.com

Martin Patrick McDowell BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER & HEWES P. O. Drawer 119 Jackson, MS 39205-0119 Email: pmcdowell@brunini.com

Walter H. Boone FORMAN, PERRY, WATKINS, KRUTZ & TARDY, PLLC P.O. Box 22608 Jackson, MS 39225-2608 Email: whboone@fpwk.com

Walter T. Johnson WATKINS & EAGER P. O. Box 650 Jackson, MS 39205-0650 Email: wjohnson@watkinseager.com

David W. Upchurch HOLLAND RAY UPCHURCH AND HILLEN P.O. Drawer 409 Tupelo, MS 38802-0409 Email: dwu@hruhpa.com Joseph Anthony Sclafani BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, P. O. Drawer 119 Jackson, MS 39205-0119 Email: jsclafani@brunini.com

Margaret Sams Gratz MITCHELL, MCNUTT & SAMS - Tupelo P. O. Box 7120 Tupelo, MS 38802-7120 Email: mgratz@mitchellmcnutt.com

Yonatan Even CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP Worldwide Plaza 825 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10019 Email: yeven@cravath.com

Aaron M. Panner KELLOGG, HUBER, HANSEN, TODD, EVANS & FIGEL PLLC 1615 M Street NW, Suite 400 Washington State, DC 20036 Email: apanner@khhte.com

Michael K. Kellogg KELLOGG, HUBER, HANSEN, TODD, EVANS & FIGEL PLLC 1615 M Street NW, Suite 400 Washington State, DC 20036 Email: mkellogg@khhte.com

Katie L. Wallace BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER & HEWES P. O. Drawer 119 Jackson, MS 39205-0119 Email: kwallace@brunini.com

Dated this, the 18th day of October, 2012

L. F. Sams, Jr.
MITCHELL, MCNUTT & SAMS
P. O. Box 7120
Tupelo, MS 38802-7120
Email: ssams@mitchellmcnutt.com

Roger G. Brooks CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP Worldwide Plaza 825 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10019 Email: rgbrooks@cravath.com

Otis R. Tims MITCHELL, MCNUTT & SAMS P. O. Box 7120 Tupelo, MS 38802-7120 Email: otims@mitchellmcnutt.com

Kenneth M. Fetterman KELLOGG, HUBER, HANSEN, TODD, EVANS & FIGEL PLLC 1615 M. Street NW, Suite 400 Washington State, DC 20036 Email: kfetterman@khhte.com

William J. Rinner KELLOGG, HUBER, HANSEN, TODD, EVANS & FIGEL PLLC 1615 M. Street NW, Suite 400 Washington, DC 20036 Email: wrinner@khhte.com

Carrie R. Bierman CRAVATH SWAINE & MOORE, LLP Worldwide Plaza 825 Eighth Avenue New York, NY 10019 Email: cbierman@cravath.com

<u>s/ Jim M. Greenlee</u> JIM M. GREENLEE